

Review by  
Lea Lund Larsen  
National Centre of Competence Development,  
The Danish School of Education, Aarhus University  
Denmark, summer 2009  
ASEM conference, June 2009, Bergisch Gladbach, Germany

## What do we already know about the effects of teacher training in relation to adult learners?

This review provides an analysis of a search for empirical studies regarding the efficacy of adult teacher training. The appendix is a part of a paper delivered at the ASEM conference, June 2009, Bergisch Gladbach, Germany.

The studies described in the paper were aimed to shed light on two questions asked in the abstract from the workshop “Effects of teacher training in lifelong learning”. *First* we asked *what do we already know about teacher training effects in relation to adult learners?* This will be answered by a search for systematic reviews in the international clearinghouses, and subsequently by a mapping done in the pedagogic database ERIC. The *second* question sounds: *which methods can be used to measure the effects of teacher training?* This will be illustrated by describing a research design in progress at the National Centre of Competence Development, DK, regarding a program where teachers are taught Cooperative Learning as a pedagogical and didactical method.

This appendix concerns the first question *What do we already know about teacher training effects in relation to adult learners?*<sup>1</sup> Below are the twenty one hits listed according to whether or not they are empirical studies that examine the efficacy of adult teacher training to state anything about the efficacy. Out of the twenty one studies, only four are is primary studies that deal with the specific question.

One study is an action research (Madgar, 1999, study no. 6 below) “*Implementation of a Procedure Manual to Improve Teacher Performance*”. The Southwestern Pennsylvania Area Labor-Management Committee (SPALMC), which serves approximately 180 adult students annually, experienced inconsistencies in performance among its adult education staff. The problems included teachers who arrived late half the time and only applied individualised instruction seventy percent of the time. To remedy these problems, the SPALMC undertook an action research project consisting of development of a teaching policy manual and delivery of staff in-service training. And a student questionnaire showed that after following the implementation of the policy manual and in-

---

<sup>1</sup> The following search query in ERIC: DE=((teacher training) or (teacher education)) and DE=(Teacher Effectiveness) and KW=adult\* and not KW=((elementary school) or (elementary education) or (primary school)) and not KW=child\*. The search query was limited only to show the results with free published works found in full text directly from ERIC. The period of search ranged from the earliest studies available to 2009. The educational level was chosen to be “unlimited” because I did not want to exclude possible studies by selecting only the “adult basic education” or “adult education”. Likewise I did not exclude the keyword “secondary school” or “high school” or “college” to secure the inclusion of teaching young adults. And nor did I exclude the descriptor “In-service teacher training” to make sure not to miss any that could have something to do with a more formal teacher training program. ERIC’s descriptor for the words *effect, output, impact*, recommend using: “Teacher Effectiveness”, which contains: “Degree to which teachers are successful in satisfying their objectives, obligations or functions”.

service training instructors were on time for class ninety five percent of the time and applied individualised instruction one hundred percent of the time.

Another empirical study is an unfinished research (Persichitte, 1993, study no. 7 below) “*Instructional Strategies for Metacognitive Development: An In-service Design*”. The purpose of the study is that the teachers learn to teach instructional strategies that promote metacognitive development to classroom teachers in their roles as instructional designers, based on the notion that instruction in metacognitive strategies must be incorporated into content instruction. An initial test of the in-service design, not yet evaluated formally, indicates its utility and the positive reaction of teachers. Regarding to the results it is important to mention that “The data has not yet been collected, the “reviews” are very positive“, therefore the results are weak. It has not been possible to find a follow up study from the researcher in ERIC.

A third study concerns a three-year research project (Marlowe, 1991, study no. 13 below) “*Adult Basic Skills Instructor Training Project (1988-1991)*”. The purpose of the study was to improve basic skills instructor training in North Carolina's 58 community colleges. It was designed to develop a cadre of local trainers who could meet the training and development needs of basic skills instructors at each community college. This project concerned instructors. i.e. teachers who taught teachers how to improve their local staff development plan. The project identified seventy-one instructor trainer competencies and the competency training was based on Kolb's experiential learning theory. Evaluations indicated that participants viewed the information as useful, and that colleges were incorporating the instructor trainer role in their local staff development plan.

The last empiric study is (Lindsey, 1969, study no. 21 below) “*A Program of Professional Readings for Secondary School English Teachers*” which examines a group of seventy six secondary school English teachers, who attended a program whose goal was to enhance the teachers' effectiveness regarding positive changes in the teachers' cognitions, feelings and action tendencies. The study showed that many of the teachers experienced profound changes in their cognitions, feelings, and their actions tendencies as a result of the program. The results indicated that professional readings can change teacher attitude and performance, and that a broad program of readings is an effective method to update English teachers. The greatest change was accomplished when theory was juxtaposed with practical application in presenting material.

We have some indications from the four findings that there is a positive effect of teacher training in-service programs in the area of adult learners. Especially when the teachers are given hands-on lessons and when the project's purpose is to enhance teachers' professional development. Generally, the effect of the interventions is measured by changes in the teachers' behavior, values or feelings, and not from the students the teachers meet after attending the training.

The twenty one findings indicate that the international field of adult teacher education is hardly formalized comprises in-service teacher training programs.<sup>2</sup> And furthermore the findings indicate a broad interest in the field but seldom with a specific interest in the effect or say outcome of a teacher training program.

---

<sup>2</sup> All the findings indicate that the field of teacher training contains a great deal of in-service programs. Eleven studies involve “In-service Teacher Education”.

The findings shows a great interest in developing guidelines, toolkits and handbooks in use for institution of adult education (See studies nos.: 8, 10, 12, 18, 20 below: *Guidelines for the Academic Preparation of Mathematics Faculty at Two-Year Colleges*, 1992; Hall, 1991; *New Learner: New Clientele. Faculty Development Program, 1976/77*, 1976; O'Conlin, 1992; *Summer Institute for Adult Basic Education Teachers of Spanish-Speaking Adults: July 12-30, 1971. Final Report.*, 1972). In addition, there is a great deal of interest in discussing and exploring what kind of competencies a teacher must possess to be able to teach adult learners, and also in relation to building up an acknowledged profession as adult teachers (Studies nos.: 2, 3, 5, 9, 16: Bents, 1978; Brown, 2002; Kerka, 2003; Leach, 1992; Sabatini, 2000). One researcher shows an interest in gaining knowledge about how teachers learn (Study no.: 11: Barnes, 1992) and in how teacher candidates perceive their teacher training while they are students (Study no: 1, 15: Armstrong, 2007; Pfister, 1984). One study concerns the methodological dimensions of how to evaluate the teachers' learning outcome after they have attended a teacher training program (Study no.: 17: Anderson, 1977). In-service programs, their purpose and intentions are outlined (Especially study no.: 4: Llorente, Porras, & Martinez, 2001). Moreover there are panel discussions which contain papers with broad contents (Study no.: 14, 19: Flanders, 1975; Horn, 1985).

We can conclude that there is a lack of research into the measurement of effect of teacher training in relation to the field of adult education.

1.

**Author/ date:** Armstrong, Dorothy Ciner (2007)

**Title:** Using Drawn Images to Prepare Teachers Who Can Envision and Actualize a World of Educational Quality

**Nationality:** United States of American.

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Teaching Methods; Teacher Effectiveness; Research Design; Educational; Quality; Teacher Education Programs; Teacher Educators; Reflective; Teaching; Cognitive Style; Self Disclosure (Individuals); Quasiexperimental Design; Questionnaires; Likert Scales; Freehand; Drawing

**Purpose:** The purpose of this study was to explore ways that teacher educators could help TCs (Teacher candidates) examine their beliefs about teaching and learning so that they could affirm, reject, or modify them as they embarked on their teaching careers.

**Study method:** A primary study: This research was a component of a yearlong graduate initial teacher certification program for returning adults that combined concurrent coursework with a yearlong internship in a single school. Study Sample: The 115 graduate students included: 67 elementary level TCs (53 female and 14 male); and 47 secondary (27 female and 20 male).

**Results:** The results of these studies strongly supported the use of the actual and ideal school drawings to determine teacher candidates' learning preferences and beliefs about teaching and learning. TCs expressed learning style preferences that were consistent between their actual and ideal school pictures.

**Education Level:** Elementary Secondary Education

**Excluded:** Wrong focus: The study is about the time students spend during their education period and do not regard the effect of the intervention in their working life as teachers.

---

2.

**Author/ date:** Kerka, Sandra (2003)

**Title:** Does Adult Educator Professional Development Make a Difference? Myths and Realities.

**Nationality:** United States of America

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Adult Basic Education; Adult Education; Adult Educators; Evaluation Problems; Inquiry; Inservice Teacher Education; Instructional Effectiveness; Outcomes of Education; Professional Continuing Education; Professional Development; Professional Training; Reflective Teaching; Teacher Collaboration; Teacher Effectiveness; Teacher Improvement; Teacher Researchers; Teaching Methods; Transformative Learning; Workshops

**Purpose and study method:** This publication is a discussion paper. It examines research reports and other literature to address misconceptions about professional development (PD) in adult education in terms of models, methods, and impact. Their starting point is: outline: How to demonstrate the impact of professional development on learning outcomes is in dispute”.

**Results:** Using learner achievement as a measure is problematic, because factors associated with the practitioners, learners, programs, and PD system also influence outcomes. A more inclusive definition of PD and a broader conception of impact can help in assessing the effectiveness of professional development.”

**Education Level:** Adult Basic Education; Adult Education

**Excluded:** Wrong research focus. Contains a discussion paper, no primary study.

---

3.

**Author/ date:** Brown, Bettina Lankard (2002)

**Title:** Professional Development for Career Educators. ERIC Digest.

**Nationality:** United States of America

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Appropriate Technology; Career Academies; Career Counseling; Career Education; Career Exploration; Change Strategies; Classroom Techniques; Conferences; Critical Thinking; Education Work Relationship; Educational Change; Educational Theories; Governance; Inservice Teacher Education; Integrated Curriculum; Interpersonal Competence; Knowledge Base for Teaching; Learning Processes; Literature Reviews; Mentors; Modeling (Psychology); Postsecondary Education; Professional Continuing Education; Professional Development; Student Needs; Teacher Collaboration; Teacher Education; Teacher Effectiveness; Teacher Role; Teacher Student Relationship; Teacher Workshops; Teaching Methods;

Tech Prep; Technological Literacy; Thinking Skills; Unions

**Purpose and study method:** This Digest describes the new role of career educators in providing career awareness, counseling, exploration, and guidance, as well as successful professional development practices for career educators and others. The digest is a discussion on the basis of a small scale literature review.

**Results:** The digest concludes that school-to-work, curriculum integration, and new career development theories have implications for how career educators approach teaching and learning. Professional development activities may enable them to broaden and expand their expertise in performing their new roles and connecting education, work, and career.

Professional development is a key tool for career educators to use in enhancing interpersonal skills such as communication, negotiation, and teamwork. In order to best serve teachers, professional development activities must have the following characteristics: (1) ongoing and long term; (2) job-embedded and inquiry-based; (3) supportive of current teaching beliefs; (4) related to reform efforts; (5) based upon appropriate adult learning experiences; and (6) support systemic change.

**Education Level:** Postsecondary Education

**Excluded:** Discussion paper, it is no primary study. Wrong research scope, concerns professional development and not the effect of the development

---

4.

**Author/ date:** Llorente, Juan Carlos; Porras, Marta; Martinez, Rosa (2001)

**Title:** Math In-Service Training for Adult Educators.

**Nationality:** Argentina

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Adult Basic Education; Adult Educators; Adult Vocational Education; Context Effect; Curriculum Development; Educational Cooperation; Faculty Development; Inservice Teacher Education; Mathematics Education; Prior Learning; Reflective Teaching; Teacher Collaboration; Teacher Developed Materials; Teacher Effectiveness; Teaching Methods; Teaching Models; Team Teaching; Theory Practice Relationship

**Purpose and study method:** The aim was to create conditions to make explicit and bring into reflection the

teaching strategies used by teachers of adult education and vocational education.

The paper reports an experience developed in the south of Argentina with adult educators, which concentrate on a series of workshops on math education as a part of a larger State project aiming at constructing a unified curriculum for adult basic education and vocational education.

In a series of mathematics education workshops in which teachers from adult basic education and vocational education worked together to design teaching situations on particular contents in mathematics in order to make explicit and bring into reflection the teaching strategies used by each group. The workshops constituted a common space of interaction for jointly designing teaching situations and creating common discourses that narrowed the distance between normative curriculum and actual teaching or real curriculum.

The paper present some examples of the situations designed during the workshops. The authors discuss the situations considering the limits and possibilities of the teaching strategies regarding the particular content involved.

**Results:** The authors point out the potentialities of the workshop to be a tool for narrowing the distance between prescription and practice where the workshops constitute common spaces of interaction for jointly designing teaching situations and create common discourses between the two communities of practitioners.

In order for adult educators to teach effectively they must fulfill the following conditions: (1) they must provide a context for the teaching; (2) the knowledge taught must constitute a solution adapted to the problem; (3) there must be didactic variables that lead to the development of logic in a fruitful way; and (4) they must take into account students' previous experience.

**Education Level:** Adult Basic Education

**Excluded:** The work shop must be categorized as a primary study but it contains a wrong research scope, because the paper did not refer to the effect of the workshop.

---

5.

**Author/ date:** Sabatini, John P.; Daniels, Melanie; Ginsburg, Lynda; Limeul, Kelly; Russell, Mary; Stites, Regie (2000)

**Title:** Teacher Perspectives on the Adult Education Profession: National Survey Findings about an Emerging Profession.

**Nationality:** United States of America

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Adult Basic Education; Adult Education; Adult Educators; Comparative Analysis; Credentials; Educational Attitudes; Educational Environment; Educational Needs; Educational Practices; English (Second Language); Faculty Development; Full Time Faculty; Job Satisfaction; National Surveys; Needs Assessment; Part Time Faculty; Questionnaires; Tables (Data); Teacher Attitudes; Teacher Certification; Teacher Characteristics; Teacher Competencies; Teacher Education; Teacher Effectiveness; Teacher Improvement; Teacher Qualifications; Teacher Surveys; Teaching Experience; Teaching Methods; Teaching (Occupation)

**Purpose and study method:** Teacher perspectives on the adult education profession were examined in a national survey designed to improve understanding of the current cadre of "professional" adult educators and assess their experiences, needs, and preferences for professional development.

The study is a primary study: A 31-item questionnaire, called the Professional Development Kit Needs Assessment, was distributed to each 466 adult education programs nationwide (five survey packets per program). The mailing of 2,330 questionnaires yielded 423 usable responses (response rate, 18%).

**Results:** The survey revealed a striking degree of similarity between the preparation and experience of adult basic education, General Educational Development, and English-as-a-second-language teachers. Nearly half those surveyed stated that the primary purpose of professional development activities should be to provide teachers with classroom techniques that they could use immediately. The respondents' highest professional development priorities were as follows: add to instructional skills, add to knowledge of teaching adults, improve knowledge of how people learn in content areas; learn to incorporate technology into instruction; learn how other teachers conduct their practice; and improve classroom management skills. Eighty-eight percent of respondents believed that they made the correct decision when deciding to become an adult education practitioner.

**Education Level:** Adult Basic Education; Adult Education

**Excluded:** Because of Wrong research focus. The research is examining how to improve the understanding of the professional adult educators, by getting assess to their experiences, needs, and preferences for professional development.

---

6.

**Author/ date:** Madgar, Eileen (1999)

**Title:** Implementation of a Procedure Manual to Improve Teacher Performance. Action Research Monograph.

**Nationality:** United States of America

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Action Research; Adult Basic Education; Adult Educators; Adult Literacy; Educational Policy; High School Equivalency Programs; Individualized Instruction; Inservice Teacher Education; Literacy Education; Material Development; Policy Formation; Program Development; Program Effectiveness; Questionnaires; Records (Forms); Teacher Effectiveness; Teacher Improvement; Teacher Researchers; Teaching Guides.

**Purpose:** The Southwestern Pennsylvania Area Labor-Management Committee (SPALMC), which serves approximately 180 adult students annually, was experiencing inconsistencies in performance among its adult education staff. The problems included teachers arriving late 50% of the time and individualizing instruction only 70% of the time. To remedy these problems, the SPALMC undertook an action research project consisting of development of a teaching policy manual and delivery of staff in-service training.

**Study method:** Primary study. Action Research. First, existing performance problems were documented through field observations and a student survey. Next, a procedural manual for SPALMC's instructors was developed that covered start times for full- and part-time instructors, proper student intake procedures, and development of individualized lessons for students. The new manuals were discussed with all SPALMC instructors, and instructors were offered additional materials and training on planning individualized instruction.

The intervention consisted of written policies and staff in-service training. Data collection strategies consisted of student questionnaires, logs, and document analysis.

**Results:** Field observations, conducted at the end of the project, confirmed that the new manual and staff training had resulted in a 45% improvement in teacher

performance. Observation of instructors prior to intervention revealed that instructors arrived late to their class sites 50% of the time. Student questionnaires revealed that instructors were using individual instruction only 70% of the time, but following the implementation of the policy manual and in-service training instructors were on time for class 95% of the time and using individualized instruction 100% of the time.

**Education Level:** Adult Basic Education; High School Equivalency Programs

**Included:** This primary study focuses on the effect of a teacher training program.

---

7.

**Author/ date:** Persichitte, Kay A. (1993)

**Title:** Instructional Strategies for Metacognitive Development: An In-service Design.

**Nationality:** United States of America

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Advance Organizers; Concept Mapping; Faculty Development; High Schools; Imagery; Inservice Teacher Education; Instructional Development; Instructional Effectiveness; Instructional Improvement; Metacognition; Metaphors; Mnemonics; Postsecondary Education; Secondary School Teachers; Teacher Effectiveness; Teacher Improvement; Teaching Methods.

**Purpose:** An in-service program to teach instructional strategies that promote metacognitive development to classroom teachers in their roles as instructional designers, based on the notion that instruction in metacognitive strategies must be incorporated into content instruction, is described. Teachers were informed about the following specific metacognitive strategies: (1) chunking; (2) framing; (3) concept mapping; (4) use of metaphor; (5) use of advance organizers; (6) rehearsing; (7) use of imagery; and (8) use of mnemonics. The in-service program is directed at the secondary level for any content area, but may easily be adapted for any level, kindergarten through adult. The in-service program begins with an examination of the importance of metacognition and moves into discussions of the specific strategies.

**Study method:** An in-service program is in progress. The purpose is that the teachers learn to teach instructional strategies that promote metacognitive development to classroom teachers in their roles as instructional designers, based on the notion that instruction in

metacognitive strategies must be incorporated into content instruction. Regarding to the studies research method: "The data has not yet been collected, the "reviews" are very positive".

### Results

An initial test of the in-service design, not yet evaluated formally, indicates its utility and the positive reaction of teachers. But the conclusion of the in-service is a discussion of factors which seem to influence the degree of effectiveness of any particular metacognitive strategy.

**Education Level:** High Schools; Postsecondary Education. The study referred to is in secondary level

**Included:** Primary study, but not yet finished why the results are weak, it has not been possible to find a follow up study from the researcher, where she deliver the final results and effect of the in-service program.

---

8.

**Author/ date:** Report: ED368428. 11pp. Nov 1992

**Title:** Guidelines for the Academic Preparation of Mathematics Faculty at Two-Year Colleges.

**Nationality:** United States of America

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** College Mathematics; College Role; Community Colleges; Continuing Education; Full Time Faculty; Mathematics Teachers; Part Time Faculty; Professional Training; Standards; Teacher Education; Teacher Education Curriculum; Teacher Effectiveness; Teacher Qualifications; Two Year Colleges.

**Purpose and study methods:** The purpose is to guide the Academic Preparation of Mathematics Faculty at Two-Year Colleges. The article addressed to two-year college professionals responsible for staffing and evaluating mathematics programs and university personnel responsible for programs that prepare college mathematics teachers, this document provides recommendations for training effective community college mathematics faculty adopted by the American Mathematical Association of Two-Year Colleges.

Following a statement of purpose and discussion of the factors that motivated the development of the guidelines, recommendations for the formal preparation of mathematics faculty are provided.

**Results:** These guidelines indicate that the minimum requirements of full- and part-time faculty should be at least a master's degree in mathematics or a related field with at least 18 semester hours in graduate-level mathematics; that the standard preparation of full-time instructors should be at least 30 semester hours toward a master's degree, with secondary or collegiate teaching experience; and that mathematics faculty should continue formal advanced coursework towards Doctor of Arts, Doctor of Philosophy, Doctor of Education, or a second master's degree. Next, essential areas of mathematical and pedagogical content are outlined, indicating that course work should include discrete mathematics, computer science, calculus, algebra, and geometry, as well as the psychology of learning mathematics, techniques of mathematics instruction, and mathematics for adult learners and special needs students. Finally, closing sections discuss the role of continuing education in faculty preparation and part-time mathematics faculty.

**Education Level:** Two Year Colleges

**Excluded:** Wrong research focus. It is a guideline for the Academic Preparation of Mathematics Faculty at Two-Year Colleges and no primary study.

---

9.

**Author/ date:** Leach, James (1992)

**Title:** Private Sector Instructors: The Nature of Effective Vocational Educators Working in Business and Industry.

**Nationality:** United States of America

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Education Work Relationship; High Schools; Instructional Effectiveness; Outcomes of Education; Personality Traits; Postsecondary Education; Private Sector; Teacher Characteristics; Teacher Education Curriculum; Teacher Effectiveness; Teaching Skills; Vocational Education; Vocational Education Teachers.

**Purpose and study method:**

The project sought to identify the traits and pedagogical expertise needed by vocational educators who work in business and industry and to determine whether current vocational teacher education is appropriate preparation for them.

It is a primary study where the following subjects were asked to describe on a mailed questionnaire the excellent vocational instructors who work for them: 500

supervisors in secondary schools (250 responses), 500 supervisors in postsecondary schools (266 responses), and 500 supervisors in business and industry (204 responses). Ratings were based on Spectrum I and the Adult Personality Inventory, involving the following variables: extroverted, adjusted, tough minded, independent, creative, enterprising, caring, adaptive, withdrawn, submissive, uncaring, nonconforming, sociable, assertive, practical, aesthetic, social, competitive, structured, accomplishment, recognition, power, and affiliation.

Results indicated that excellent instructors in all three settings, mentioned above, were more similar than dissimilar but that they were rated significantly different from the general population on most of the variables. In another part of the study, vocational teacher educators from 21 institutions (75 usable responses) were asked to rate how important 25 competencies are to their graduates and the extent to which each competency, identified by the American Society for Training and Development as a model for good human resource development practice, is covered in coursework

**Results:** Twenty competencies were rated at least somewhat important, but only seven competencies were said to be covered at least adequately.

**Education Level:** High Schools; Postsecondary Education

**Excluded:** Wrong research focus.

---

10.

**Author/ date:** O'Conlin, Michaele (1992)

**Title:** TALKit. Teaching Adult Learners Kit. Professional Development Activities for Teachers of Adult Learners.

**Nationality:** United States of America

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Adult Basic Education; Adult Educators; Adult Learning; Adult Students; Classroom Techniques; Educational Philosophy; Inservice Teacher Education; Professional Development; Student Evaluation; Teacher Behavior; Teacher Effectiveness; Teacher Improvement; Teacher Workshops; Teaching Methods.

**Purpose an study method:** This Teaching Adult Learners Kit (TALKit) is an inservice "cafeteria" that offers many choices to the workshop planner/facilitator.

The core of the kit is a series of structured workshop activities designed to help teachers build a teaching foundation--a working philosophy for adult education. Activities focus on three areas: the philosophy of teaching and learning, understanding adult learners, and effective teaching of adults. The workshop activities are all interactive, hands-on learning experiences. Introductory materials discuss the role of the facilitator and include a chart that describes each activity and areas of focus and annotated listing of videotape resources. Each of the 10 activities has some or all of these components: introduction, purpose, materials list, preparation, organization, time, numbers, followup, transparency masters, handouts, and supplementary materials. Activities are as follows: "drawing" conclusions about teaching adults; nothing personal, but...; speak out on learning; straight talk; TALK about adult learners; teachers make it work; thumbs up, thumbs down; when I teach I...; words of wisdom; and worth a thousand words. Followup options are included for teachers who want more information, a deeper experience, or resources to help them prepare a personal professional development plan. Appendixes include sample inservice programs and masters for producing a teacher journal.

**Results:** It is a guideline kit for Teaching Adult Learners

**Education Level:** Adult Basic Education

**Excluded:** Wrong research focus. It is a guideline kit for Teaching Adult Learners that offers choices to the workshop planner/facilitator.

---

11.

**Author/ date:** Barnes, Cynthia A. (1992)

**Title:** Developing Teachers: "When the Student Is Ready..." The Developmental "Waves" of Teachers as Learners.

**Nationality:** ?

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** College Faculty; Community Colleges; Developmental Psychology; Developmental Stages; Teacher Behavior; Teacher Education; Teacher Effectiveness; Teacher Expectations of Students; Teacher Improvement; Teacher Motivation; Teacher Role; Teacher Student Relationship; Teaching (Occupation); Teaching Styles; Two Year Colleges

**Purpose and study method:** The extensive body of research and knowledge on adult learners has rarely been applied to teachers, themselves. Teachers, like adult learners everywhere, bring an assortment of experiences, needs, wishes, and fears to the learning process.

The paper is a theoretical discussion about how to understand teachers as learners.

Drawing on Kolb's learning styles and Blanchard's situational leadership model, the growth of instructors from novice to master teachers can be mapped. Progression through four developmental stages, or waves, results in an overall shift from teacher-centered to learner-centered instruction. In *Wave One*, the Discovery Stage, teachers are almost totally self-focused and directed. Novice teachers are often enthusiastic about accomplishing a new job or task, though they may lack some of the competencies needed to perform effectively. In this stage, teachers are especially concerned with "covering the material." In *Wave Two*, the Invention Stage, the self continues to be the primary focus, as teachers specialize in a particular area, and gain mastery of a specific learning and teaching style. However, at this stage, instructors also become aware of and ask questions about their "audience." In *Wave Three*, the Integration Stage, the self begins to be experienced more as a process and less as content, as instructors experiment with relationships among the teacher, the teaching process, and the learners. Dissatisfaction with what students are learning becomes a catalyst for inquiry, and teachers adopt new methods of instruction as they equate learning with doing. In *Wave Four*, the Reflection Stage, teachers perceive themselves as co-learners in and facilitators of a transformative process, marked by the actualization of learners' potential.

**Results:** The paper argues for the use of Kolb's learning styles and Blanchard's situational leadership model. Through the growth of instructors from novice to master teachers can be mapped.

**Education Level:** Two Year Colleges

**Excluded:** Not primary study, theoretical discussion paper

---

12.

**Author/ date:** Hall, William C.; Are, Linda (1991)

**Title:** Improving Effectiveness. Suggestions for TAFE Teachers.

**Nationality:** Australia

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Adult Educators; Foreign Countries; Postsecondary Education; School Business Relationship; Self Evaluation (Individuals); Teacher Education; Teacher Effectiveness; Teacher Evaluation; Teacher Improvement; Teaching Methods; Teaching Skills; Technical Education; Vocational Education Teachers.

**Purpose and study method:** This guide suggests approaches that new and experienced Technical and Further Education (TAFE) teachers may find useful in answering questions that may lead to improvement in their teaching effectiveness.

In the first part of the guide, such questions are discussed, together with possible strategies for answering them and useful reference texts.

Questions were supplied by full-time college teachers, who were asked to identify the indicators of effective teaching. Questions are grouped under five headings: contextual, teaching, administration/management, professional matters, and industry links. A bibliography lists 68 references.

Appendixes in the second part of the guide include information on designing and administering questionnaires and a sample self-evaluation questionnaire; different ways of seating groups; a time analysis chart; New South Wales Department of TAFE teacher evaluation forms; an example of an agenda; a list of National Industry Training Committees; a South Australian sample self-appraisal of teaching; and a brochure about the TAFE National Clearinghouse vocational education and training database.

**Results:** A guideline for and experienced Technical and Further Education teachers.

**Education Level:** Postsecondary Education

**Excluded:** Wrong focus - It is a guideline for and experienced Technical and Further Education teachers

---

13.

**Author/ date:** Marlowe, Mike; And Others (1991)

**Title:** Adult Basic Skills Instructor Training Project (1988-1991). Phase I (1988-1989) and Phase II (1989-1990) Report.

**Nationality:** America

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC**

Adult Basic Education; Adult Educators; Basic Skills; Community Colleges; Competency Based Teacher Education; Experiential Learning; Institutes (Training Programs); Program Development; Program Implementation; Resource Teachers; Summer Programs; Teacher Certification; Teacher Effectiveness; Teacher Workshops; Trainers; Two Year Colleges

**Purpose and study method:** To improve basic skills instructor training in North Carolina's 58 community colleges, the Department of Community Colleges funded a 3-year Adult Basic Skills Training Project. It was designed to develop a cadre of local trainers who could meet the training and development needs of basic skills instructors at each community college.

It is a primary study: Adult basic education instructors from all the community colleges were selected to participate in five regional workshops and three summer institutes. Seventy-one instructor trainer competencies were identified. Competency training was based on Kolb's experiential learning theory. Participants who completed the 165 hours of instruction represented by the institutes and workshops spaced over a 30-month period would receive a certificate as a Resource Specialist in Basic Skills Instructor Training. The first three workshops and two summer institutes offered instruction in interpersonal communication skills, assessment strategies, methods and materials, reading comprehension, and instructional management.

At the completion of the workshop 1, all participants were blindly surveyed with a four point Likert scale (with "1" being no value and "4" being great value) by a graduate assistant to determine their perceptions of the usefulness of the workshop content in instructor training. (More results are mentioned at page 10.) At the completion of each workshop participants were surveyed with a six point Likert style scale (with "1" being no value and "6" being great value) by graduate assistant to determine their perceptions of the utility of the workshop content in instructor training. (p.16 + p. 17 for workshop 3).

Also a survey of the instructor trainers' development was done. A four choice Likert style scale was completed by the instructor trainers in response to questions that indicates the extent to which the instructor have been able to share with/demonstrate what you have learned to other basic skills staff. The pilot survey ratings and from comments of the instructor trainers it appears the majority of the colleges are incorporating the instructor trainer role in their local staff development. (p. 21).

**Results:** Evaluations indicated that participants viewed the information as useful and colleges were incorporating the instructor trainer role in their local staff development plan. Attached tables provide: (1) data about workshop participants; (2) indicators of competence; and (3) participants' ratings of the program's usefulness.

**Education Level:** Adult Basic Education; Two Year Colleges

**Included:**

Primary study included. An evaluation of the a three year project offered Adult basic education instructors instruction in interpersonal communication skills, assessment strategies, methods and materials, reading comprehension, and instructional management

---

14.

**Author/ date:** Horn, Jerry, (Ed.); Davis, Patricia, (Ed.)

**Title:** Education and Equity in Rural America: 1984 and Beyond. Proceedings of the Annual Rural and Small Schools Conference (6th, Manhattan, Kansas, October 29-30, 1984).

**Nationality:** United States of America

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Adult Education; Elementary Secondary Education; Higher Education; Inservice Teacher Education; Rural Education; Rural Schools; Small Schools; Teacher Effectiveness

**Purpose and study methods:** The proceedings consist of the entire major addresses of Senator Nancy Landon Kassebaum, Steve Miller, and Walter Turner, and abbreviated versions of 29 other papers or presentations. The materials deal with a variety of rural-focused topics. Mostly the papers outline programs to come, and deal with educational Acts and their influence in small schools in rural America. And few papers refer to primary studies.

The subjects are: women (Evelyn Hausmann); teacher career ladder plans (Paul Burden); inservice (Robert Norton, Myron Ballain, Dian Castle); Iowa's small rural districts (William Drier); Nebraska's Center for Rural Education and Small Schools (Roger Hanson and Frank Shaugnessy); curriculum development (Gerald Bailey); minority students (Ronald Lantaff); North Dakota's rural high schools (Karla Smart and Cecilia Traugh); effective schools research (Paul Nachtigal); word processing (Custer Whiteside and Janet Whiteside); energy education (Larry Enochs); serving students with disabilities (Doris Helge); evaluating administrators (Douglas Christensen); and com-

puter technology (Custer Whiteside and Lew McGill, Jan Brandt). Additional rural-focused topics include: teacher effectiveness (Douglas Christensen, Nancy Mangano and Michael Perl); graduation requirements (Roger Baskerville); first aid emergencies (John Walker); office management (S. Sterling Troxel); Kansas principal turnover (Al Wilson and John Heim); gifted education (Allen McCune); public policy on education (Thomas Moriarty); school planning and redevelopment (Vernon Deines); public relations (Ron Ballard); school experience memory study (Barbara Bontempo and Ardeth Deay); and adult education (Sue Maes and Sandra Moore).

**Results:** It is hard to outline the results since the papers mostly outline programs to come, and deal with educational Acts and their influence in small schools in rural America and few papers refer to primary studies.

**Education Level:** Adult Education; Elementary Secondary Education; Higher Education

**Excluded:** Wrong research focus. None of the papers deal with the effect of teacher training.

---

15.

**Author/ date:** Pfister, Jill; Newcomb, L. H. (1984)

**Title:** Evaluation of the Student Teaching Program in Agricultural Education at the Ohio State University. Summary of Research.

**Nationality:** United States of America

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Administrator Attitudes; Administrator Evaluation; Agricultural Education; Cooperating Teachers; Preservice Teacher Education; Program Effectiveness; Program Evaluation; Student Attitudes; Student Teacher Supervisors; Student Teachers; Student Teaching; Teacher Attitudes; Teacher Effectiveness; Teacher Evaluation; Vocational Education; Vocational Education Teachers

**Purpose and study method:** The purpose of this study is an evaluation of the student teaching program in agricultural education at The Ohio State University.

The purpose of this study was to evaluate the student teaching program in Agricultural Education at the Ohio State University by answering the following research question: 1) to what extent are the experiences and assignments a student teacher is expected to have in agricultural Education at the Ohio State University needed in preparinig a propective teacher for successful teaching in vocational agriculture as perceived by university supervisors, cooperating teachers and

student teachers? 2). To what extent are these experiences and assignments accomplished by the student teaching program as perceived by university supervisors, cooperating teachers and student teachers in Agricultural Education at The Ohio State University? 3) How do cooperating teachers and student teachers rate the performance of the university supervisors in their supervision of the student teachers in Agriculture Education at The Ohio State University? 4) How do the university supervisors and student teachers rate the performance of cooperating teachers in their supervision of student teachers in Agricultural Education at The Ohio State University? 5). What suggestions for change can be made by the researchers to improve the student teaching program in in Agricultural Education at The Ohio State University as a result of this study?

It is a primary study. The student teaching program in agricultural education at The Ohio State University, university supervisors, cooperating teachers, and student teachers were asked their perceptions regarding the need for experiences and assignments and the extent to which they were accomplished. Cooperating teachers and student teachers also rated the performance of university supervisors in supervision of student teachers, and university supervisors and student teachers rated the performance of cooperating teachers. Data were collected by mailed questionnaires, face-to-face interviews, and telephone interviews. This triangulation approach enabled the researchers to integrate both quantitative and qualitative methods of research.

**Results:** All but two experiences expected during student teaching were considered essential, and the student teachers were perceived to be adequately prepared to teach. All assignments were rated desirable except two that were rated essential. A majority of the assignments were rated as satisfactorily accomplished. Generally rated as above average, university supervisors needed more emphasis on prior evaluation of student teachers' lesson plans and service as a resource person for cooperating teachers. Cooperating teachers needed greater emphasis on feedback on lesson plans prior to teaching, evaluation of student teacher's performance, and provision for experience in adult and/or continuing education and supervised occupational experience visits. Better preparation of cooperating teachers and changes in assignments were recommended.

**Education Level:** University student in agriculture.

**Excluded:** This study reports about the student teachers experience and perception of a teaching program, and thereby inform us about one teacher training program and its effect on the attending students, but it

doesn't investigate the impact of the program throughout the students following working life, where they are about to teach, is why the study is excluded.

---

16.

**Author/ date:** Bents, Richard H.; Howey, Kenneth R. (1978).

**Title:** Alternative Strategies for the Delivery of Inservice.

**Nationality:** United States of America

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Cognitive Development; Delivery Systems; Educational Environment; Individual Development; Inservice Teacher Education; Instructional Improvement; Interpersonal Relationship; Professional Continuing Education; Teacher Behavior; Teacher Effectiveness

**Purpose and study method:** The means by which different delivery strategies can be matched with or made to accommodate to different inservice goals are discussed. A framework for assessing when one delivery strategy is more appropriate than another is provided. The framework for planning inservice delivery outlines distinct but complementary strategies that focus upon three basic and related goals. The first of these goals is to enhance adult cognitive, intrapersonal, and interpersonal development as it impinges upon teaching effectiveness. The second is to alter environmental (school) conditions that impinge upon teaching effectiveness. The final goal is to improve teaching effectiveness directly, especially by altering teacher instructional behavior in situ.

**Results:** Teachers referred to from other studies engage in different forms of inservice to achieve these different goals and select their goals on the basis of their personal assessment of needs. Alternative strategies for the delivery of inservice education are considered necessary to achieve a comprehensive program.

**Education Level:** May be elementary school, because at page 18 they refer to "the school staff".

**Excluded:** This study is no primary study. It is about teachers continuing professional development qua inservice programs. The article discuss and recommend a framework for assessing when one delivery strategy is more appropriate than another.

---

17.

**Author/ date:** Anderson, Elaine J. (1977)

**Title:** Preinstructional Strategies and Learning Outcome of Teachers in a Series of Health Education Workshops.

**Nationality:** -

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Behavioral Objectives; Educational Strategies; Environmental Education; Guidance Objectives; Health Education; Inservice Teacher Education; Instructional Design; Performance Factors; Sex Education; Student Evaluation; Teacher Education; Teacher Effectiveness; Teacher Workshops; Teaching Methods.

**Purpose and study method:** The objective of this study was to identify effective instructional strategies for teachers involved in health education workshops on human sexuality and environmental health science.

More specifically, the study was designed to evaluate teachers learning outcomes following a workshop design utilizing preinstructional strategies. The investigator suggests that findings in this study lend support to use of preinstructional strategies with adult learners.

Several questions were asked to enable the investigators to evaluate the effect of the in-service model on learning outcomes utilizing preinstructional strategies (p-12).

**Results:** The study incorporated preinstructional strategies in teacher inservice health education workshops and the learning outcomes of the 192 participants based on posttest mean scores were significantly enhanced.

**Education Level:** -

**Excluded:** This study presented at a round table session examines how to evaluate teacher learning outcomes after they have attended a workshop design utilizing preinstructional strategies. The focus is on the way to conduct an adequate measure of the teachers learning objectives. It is a model for setting objectives that makes it possible to monitor individual students' progress and mastery of stated goals, competencies and objectives.

---

18.

**Author/ date:**

Report: ED129391 (1976)

**Title:** New Learner: New Clientele. Faculty Development Program, 1976/77.

**Nationality:** United States of America

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Adult Students; Beginning Teachers; Change Strategies; College Faculty; Community Colleges; Inservice Teacher Education; Non-traditional Students; Program Descriptions; Staff Development; Student Teacher Relationship; Teacher Effectiveness; Teaching Methods; Two Year Colleges

**Purpose and study method:** This handbook for the 1976-77 Faculty Development Program at William Rainey Harper College (WRHC) is a continuation of the effort to assist the faculty in examining their own professional attitudes toward instruction and their relationships with their students. The major objectives of the 1976-77 program are to investigate the topic of "New Learners: New Clientele" specifically as it relates to the WRHC district.

**Results:** Among the programs and activities described are: (1) special funding for faculty development through research, experimentation, travel, sabbatical leaves, instructional development, and continued education; (2) a series of guest speaker presentations; and (3) the New Faculty Development Program and New Faculty Mentor Program. An overview and background material on New Learners: New Clientele comprises approximately one-half of this document. Discussed are: "new students", methods of instruction, characteristics of an open university, the implications of stages of adult development for higher education, problems in implementing open learning programs, and an overview of instructional strategies.

**Education Level:** Two Year Colleges

**Excluded:** Wrong research focus. It is no primary study regarding the effect of a teacher training program.

---

19.

**Author/ date:** Flanders, Ned A.

**Title:** Research on Teaching as Human Interaction.

**Nationality:** -

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Educational Research; Feedback; Interaction; Interaction Process Analysis; Student Teacher Relationship; Teacher Education; Teacher Effectiveness; Teacher Motivation

**Purpose and study method:** This report summarizes recommendations of a panel studying research on teaching as human interaction. Two facets of research were considered to have high priority: understanding the relationships between teacher-pupil interaction and the effects of this interaction on pupils, and understanding the capacity of motivated adults to receive feedback information while interacting with pupils.

**Results:** Recommendations were classified into three approaches to the study of teaching which dealt with a) teacher-student interaction, b) teacher education, and c) special research problems.

**Education Level:** -

**Excluded:** The report is no primary study; the report summarizes a panel discussion.

---

20.

**Author/ date:** Report: ED101168. 34pp. Aug 1972

**Title:** Summer Institute for Adult Basic Education Teachers of Spanish-Speaking Adults: July 12-30, 1971. Final Report.

**Nationality:** United States of America

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Adult Basic Education; Behavioral Objectives; Cultural Awareness; English (Second Language); Individual Development; Individual Needs; Institutes (Training Programs); Microteaching; Reading Skills; Spanish Speaking; Summer Programs; Teacher Education; Teacher Effectiveness

**Purpose and study methods:** The University of New Mexico conducted an Institute for Adult Basic Education Teachers with the goal of encouraging the approximately 100 participants, all teachers of Spanish-speaking adults, to integrate their previous knowledge and training with the information, materials, ideas, and techniques presented at the institute, to make them more effective teachers.

The main goal was accomplished through the instruction related to the institute's program objectives; (1) how to write and utilize behavioral objectives which will improve their teaching; (2) instruction in the techniques of microteaching; (3) to aid in the understanding and appreciation of the sociopsychological realities and problems of the Spanish-speaking adult; (4) instruction in the most effective methods of teaching English as a

second language and teaching reading skills in an integrated program; and (5) the utilization of the personal growth curriculum in order to meet individual needs. To attain the five objectives the institute's program concentrated on the subject areas of cultural awareness, personal growth curriculum, English as a second language, reading and guidance and counseling.

**Results:** One of the most important by-products of the institute was the development of a reading kit for beginning ABE teachers, which is briefly outlined at the conclusion.

**Education Level:** Adult Basic Education

**Excluded:** The study concentrate on how to make teachers in adult basic education more effective, but the study doesn't focus on whether the KIT they developed had the desired effect or not.

---

21.

**Author/ date:** Lindsey, Alfred J. (1969)

**Title:** A Program of Professional Readings for Secondary School English Teachers. Interim Report.

**Nationality:** United States of America

**DE: Descriptors in ERIC:** Adult Reading Programs; English Instruction; Inservice Teacher Education; Professional Continuing Education; Reading Materials; Secondary Education; Teacher Attitudes; Teacher Effectiveness; Teacher Improvement; Teaching Methods

**Purpose and study method:** The study investigates the use of professional readings for correcting weakness in teacher preparation and for bringing new information to the teacher, to evaluate the effectiveness of these readings on the thinking and teaching procedures of the teachers, and to make recommendations concerning reading programs for teachers.

For this research interest the following research question is of interest: Can the reading of professional articles change the attitude and performance of secondary school English teachers, and, specifically, selected English teachers in Illinois who do not have a major in the subject? The goal is to investigate the effectiveness of the program of the readings on the thinking and teaching procedures of the teachers involved in this study.

This study involving 76 English teachers in Illinois high schools with enrollments of less than 350.

A questionnaire survey listing pedagogical applications of ideas in the articles was administered both before and after the readings were completed. (Questionnaires, a sample rating sheet for articles, and a list of readings on language, composition, reading and inductive teaching are included.)

**Results:** The data indicated a positive change in attitude for 12 of the 40 statements on the questionnaire. The teachers planned 1,295 changes in teaching performance as a result of the readings. Concerning 84 statements of possible pedagogical changes suggested by the articles, each teacher claimed a mean of 13 changes in his teaching due to the articles, and a total of 13 planned changes for the future were listed. These results indicated that professional readings can change teacher attitude and performance, and that a broad program of readings is an effective method in updating English teachers.

The greatest change was accomplished when theory was juxtaposed with practical application in presenting material. Thus, it would appear that the readings should include applications and practical methods, though that is not to say background material is not also needed.

Many of the teachers had profound changes in their cognitions, feelings, and their actions tendencies. Whether or not these were arranged into the “enduring” systems is to be answered only by a long-term longitudinal study.

**Education Level:** Secondary Education - Secondary School English Teachers.

**Included:** The study examines a group of 76 secondary school English teachers which attend a program whose goal is to enhance the teachers’ effectiveness regarding positive changes in the teachers’ cognitions, feelings and action tendencies.

---

## Literature reviewed

- Anderson, E. J. (1977, April 4-8). *Preinstructional Strategies and Learning Outcome of Teachers in a Series of Health Education Workshops*. Paper presented at the Round table session presentation at Annual Meeting, American Educational Research Association, New York.
- Armstrong, D. (2007). Using Drawn Images to Prepare Teachers Who Can Envision and Actualize a World of Educational Quality.
- Barnes, C. A. (1992). *Developing Teachers: "When the Student Is Ready..." The Developmental "Waves" of Teachers as Learners*. Paper presented at the The International Faculty Development Conference.
- Bents, R. (1978). Alternative Strategies for the Delivery of Inservice.
- Brown, B. (2002). Professional Development for Career Educators. ERIC Digest.
- Flanders, N. A. (1975). *Research on Teaching as Human Interaction*. Paper presented at the paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational research Association.
- Guidelines for the Academic Preparation of Mathematics Faculty at Two-Year Colleges* (1992). Indianapolis.
- Hall, W. (1991). Improving Effectiveness. Suggestions for TAFE Teachers.
- Horn, J. (1985). Education and Equity in Rural America: 1984 and Beyond. Proceedings of the Annual Rural and Small Schools Conference (6th, Manhattan, Kansas, October 29-30, 1984).
- Kerka, S. (2003). Does Adult Educator Professional Development Make a Difference? Myths and Realities.
- Leach, J. (1992). *Private Sector Instructors: The Nature of Effective Vocational Educators Working in Business and Industry.*: National Center for Research in Vocational Education, Berkeley, CA.
- Lindsey, A. J. (1969). *A Program of Professional Readings for Secondary School English Teachers. Interim Report*.
- Llorente, J. C., Porrás, M., & Martínez, R. (2001). *Math In-Service Training for Adult Educators*. Paper presented at the International Conference of Adults Learning Mathematics.
- Madgar, E. (1999). *Implementation of a Procedure Manual To Improve Teacher Performance. Action Research Monograph.*: A Section 353 Project of the Pennsylvania Department of Education, Bureau of Adult Basic and Literacy Education.
- Marlowe, M. (1991). *Adult Basic Skills Instructor Training Project (1988-1991). Phase I (1988-1989) and Phase II (1989-1990) Report*: Appalachian State University, Boone, N.C. .
- New Learner: New Clientele. Faculty Development Program, 1976/77* (1976). William Rainey Harper College. Palantine.
- O'Conlin, M. (1992). *TALKit. Teaching Adult Learners Kit. Professional Development Activities for Teachers of Adult Learners*: New Mexico State Dept. of Education, Santa Fe. Div. of Vocational, Technical, and Adult Education.
- Persichitte, K. A. (1993). *Instructional Strategies for Metacognitive Development: An In-service Design*. Paper presented at the Proceedings of Selected Research and Development Presentations at the Convention of the Association for Educational Communications and Technology Sponsored by the Research and Theory Division
- Pfister, J. (1984). *Evaluation of the Student Teaching Program in Agricultural Education at the Ohio State University. Summary of Research*.
- Sabatini, J. (2000). *Teacher Perspectives on the Adult Education Profession: National Survey Findings about an Emerging Profession*.
- Summer Institute for Adult Basic Education Teachers of Spanish-Speaking Adults: July 12-30, 1971. Final Report*. (1972). New Mexico State Dept. of Education. Santa Fe. Div. of Adult Education; New Mexico University, Albuquerque Coll. of Education.